Debating Images: Seeing is Believing?

Lecturer: Ma Ran
René Magritte (Belgium)

"it is in vain that we say what we see; what we see never resides in what we say."

resemblance VS similitude, Foucault

...resemblance presumes a primary reference that prescribes and classes copies on the basis of the rigor of their mimetic relation to itself. Resemblance serves and is dominated by representation.

with similitude, the reference "anchor is gone". Things are cast adrift, more or less like one another without any of them being able to claim the priviledged status of "model" for the rest. Hierarchy gives way to a series of exclusively lateral relations.
Roland Barthes: “Rhetoric of an Image”

semmiotics: denotation VS connotation
(linguistic dimensions of pictures)

A denotation is ‘what we see’, what can be described as simply ‘there’ in the picture. Connotation is the immediate cultural meanings derived from what is seen, but it is not actually in the picture. In practice, we rarely make such distinctions because they appear together at the same time as a picture’s obvious features.

later on Barthes shifted his grounds by saying, denotation can be seen as "a process of naturalization"...when we first learn denotations, we are also being positioned within ideology by learning dominant connotations at the same time.

“Thanks to its code of connotation the reading of the photograph is thus always historical; it depends on the reader’s knowledge just as though it were a matter of a real language [langue], intelligible only if one has learnt the signs"

"the common domain of the signified of connotation is that of ideology"

---the connotations of a picture are always potentially plural. As Barthes puts it, the meaning of any photograph is polysemic.
Photographic Truth

the photograph "creates a consciousness of having-been-there", thus offering an unprecedented conjunction between what is here now (the image) and what was there then (the referent, or object, thing, or place)

The photographic signifier seems to be virtually identical with its signified, and the photograph appears to be a 'natural sign' produced without the intervention of a code.

the meaning of photographs can thus be seen as somewhat paradoxical in that they can be emotional objects through the punctum, or the emotionally piercing quality...through the effect of studium, serve as banal traces of the real, documentary evidence of something that simply has happened.

What the realist takes for granted as 'reality', semiotics argues is constructed through a photographic discourse, of codes.Contrary to the views of some sceptics, visual semiotics does not refute the existence of 'reality', rather it develops a way to speak about how the graphic marks on a flat piece of paper come to signify a 'reality'.

Reference: Barthes, Sturken & Cartwright; David Bate "Photography: Key Concepts"
Images and Ideology

Karl Marx: ideology as "false consciousness" that was spread by dominant powers among the masses

Louis Althusser: ideology is the necessary representational means through which we come to experience and make sense of reality.

ideology: the broad but indispensable shared sets of values and beliefs through which individuals live out their complex relations in a range of social networks.

Ideologies are diverse and ubiquitous: they inform our everyday lives in often subtle and barely noticeable forms.

Practices of looking are intimately tied to ideology. The image culture in which we live is an arena of diverse and often conflicting ideologies...which is produced and affirmed through the social institutions that characterize a given society. All of these everyday institutions and areas of life use images.

----S & C
Chinese Girls in Trend
紅色娘子軍 (1960)
Time Special Issue

2005 Asia's Heroes

Our annual celebration of the courageous, the gifted, the inspired and the inspiring.
icon: "an image that refers to something outside of its individual components, something (or someone) that has great symbolic meaning for many people"; they are "perceived to represent universal concepts, emotions, and meanings"...

Nevertheless, we always need to note that "their meanings are always historically and contextually produced"
At the denotative level this is a photograph of the movie star Marilyn Monroe. At a connotative level we associate this photograph with Marilyn Monroe's star qualities of glamour, sexuality, beauty - if this is an early photograph - but also with her depression, drug-taking and untimely death if it is one of her last photographs. At a mythic level we understand this sign as activating the myth of Hollywood: the dream factory that produces glamour in the form of the stars it constructs, but also the dream machine that can crush them - all with a view to profit and expediency.

--Susan Hayward
Obama is unquestionably the most visible US president to date, and this is partly an effect of his striking identity as an icon of racial difference, and partly the personal beauty of himself and his family, his sculpted facial features, his body image especially in motions that reveal his athleticism. His hyper-visibility is also a result of his unprecedented mastery of new media. Obama is not just the first Black president; he is the first wired president.

-----W.J.T. Mitchell, "Obama as Icon"
Questions:

1. What has the photographer Thomas found out about his photos? And how?
2. Could Thomas confirm what he has found out about? And how? What is the role-playing of photograph for his exploration as such?
3. How would you understand the ending scene in which Thomas encounters a group of mummers?
Questions:

1. What has the photographer Thomas found out about his photos? And how?
2. Could Thomas confirm what he has found out about? And how? What is the role-playing of photograph for his exploration as such?
3. How would you understand the ending scene in which Thomas encounters a group of mummers?