

SANSKRIT MANUSCRIPTS OF THE *SĀDHANAMĀLĀ*[†]

Ruriko SAKUMA

I. Introduction

The *Sāadhanamālā* (*Sāadhanasamuccaya*, *Sāadhanamālātāntra*, or *Sā-dhanatantra*)¹ is a compilation of *sādhanas* which were individually written not later than circa the twelfth century A.D. in Indian Tantric Buddhism.² *Sādhana* is a religious practice of visualizing a deity before one's eyes, and the *Sāadhanamālā* is one of the most valuable materials to understand procedures for visualization of deities.

Bhattacharyya [1968b] edited this text by using eight manuscripts in the two volumes: nos. 26 (Vol. I) and 41 (Vol. II) of Gaekwad's Oriental Series. Since then, this edition has been regarded as a standard text of the *Sāadhanamālā*. Including the eight manuscripts, there are at least thirty-eight manuscripts around the world. These manuscripts have different numbers and arrangements of *sādhanas*. Over the past decades the *Sāadhanamālā* has been researched,³ but the differences and correlation among the manuscripts of the *Sāadhanamālā* have not been fully made clear.

† This paper is a revised English edition of [Sakuma 1990a].

¹ Manuscripts (2-3) and (3-5) are titled: *Sāadhanasamuccaya*. Manuscripts (1-8), (2-1), (2-2), (2-3), (2-4), (3-4), (3-5), (4-2), (5-3), (7-1), and (12-2) are titled: *Sāadhanasamuccaya* in catalogues and so on. Manuscripts (1-2), (1-3) and (14) are titled: *Sāadhanamālātāntra*. A manuscript (3-3) is titled: *Sāadhanatantra* in catalogues. There are two kinds of titles: *Sāadhanamālā* and *Sāadhanamālāpāñjikāsahitā* in a manuscript (4-1). A manuscript (4-4) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā-tathā-dhāraṇī*. A manuscript (10-1) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā-prathamakaṇḍa*.

² A manuscript, on which the date of compilation of the *Sāadhanamālā* is based, is one of the manuscripts preserved at the University of Cambridge: Add. 1686. This is used in the Bhattacharyya edition (1-2). Okuyama [1988: 891] points out that it is not possible to say that the text like the Bhattacharyya edition was already established in the middle of the twelfth century A.D. because the manuscript has less than half the number of *sādhanas* of the Bhattacharyya edition. It is suggested that the original form of the *Sāadhanamālā* was compiled by Abhayākara Gupta about 1100 A.D., and then revised again and again, and the number of *sādhanas* increased gradually [Okuyama 1988: 889-890].

³ Thomas [1903], Foucher [1905: 22-39], Finot [1934], Mallmann [1964: 187-241], Koetsuka [1967], Shimizu [1977], Yoshizaki [1979], Shimoizumi [1981], Meisezahl [1980: 125-172],

From a philological point of view, the purpose of this paper is to investigate the differences and correlation between the Bhattacharyya edition and some of the unpublished manuscripts, and between some of the manuscripts which are not used in the Bhattacharyya edition. Also to summarize studies up to this time.

II. Sanskrit Manuscripts

The above-mentioned thirty-eight Sanskrit manuscripts of the *Sādhanamālā* may be listed into the following fourteen groups:

- (1) 8 manuscripts used in the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (2) 4 manuscripts preserved at the University of Tokyo.
- (3) 5 manuscripts preserved at Kyoto University.
- (4) 8 manuscripts preserved at the National Archives of Nepal (Two of them are used in the Bhattacharyya edition).
- (5) 3 manuscripts recorded in *A Microfilm Catalogue of the Buddhist Manuscripts in Nepal*.
- (6) 2 manuscripts preserved at the National Library, Paris.
- (7) 3 manuscripts preserved at the University of Cambridge (Two of them are used in the Bhattacharyya edition).
- (8) A manuscript introduced by L. Finot.
- (9) 2 manuscripts preserved at Asiatic Society (Bombay)
- (10) 3 manuscripts preserved at old Bir Library, Kathmandu (Two of them can be found in National Archives of Nepal).
- (11) A manuscript preserved at China Library of Nationalities (Beijing).
- (12) 2 manuscripts preserved at the Institute of Advanced Studies of World Religion (New York).
- (13) A manuscript preserved at Melville Memorial Library (the State University of New York).
- (14) A manuscript preserved at Bodleian Library (the University of Oxford).

Further information of the above groups is as follows:

- (1) The following explanations are based on the introduction of the Bhattacharyya edition [Bhattacharyya 1968b: preface XI-XV],

Nihom [1992], Mori [1992], Bühnemann [1994], Sakuma [1990a; 1990b; 1991; 1993; 1995; 1996; 1998; 1999; 2000], Yamaguchi [1997] and Okuyama [1998]. Researches of the *Sādhanamālā* are summarized by Tsukamoto, Matsunaga, Isoda [1989: 382-485].

Catalogue of the Buddhist Sanskrit Manuscripts in the University Library, Cambridge [Bendall 1883], *A Catalogue of Palm leaf and Selected Paper MSS belonging to the Durbar Library, Nepal*, Vol. II [Hara Prasad Śāstri 1915], *A Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Government Collection Under the Care of the Asiatic Society of Bengal*, Vol. I [Hara Prasad Śāstri 1917] and references of Bühnemann [1994]. (Codes from A to Nb are used in the Bhattacharyya edition.)

- (1-1)<A> This is recorded as no. 74 and titled: *Sāadhanamālā* in Hara Prasad Śāstri [1917: 114]. It is preserved at Asiatic Society (Calcutta). It is made of modern Nepalese paper. It has 342 folios. Complete.
- (1-2) This is recorded as Add. no. 1686 and titled: *Sāadhanamālā-tantra* in Bendall [1883: 174]. It is preserved at the University of Cambridge. The title: *Sāadhanamālā* is written on one of the covers of the manuscript, but the manuscript does not contain such a title [Bühnemann 1994: 59-60]. Bühnemann reconstructs the title: *Sādhanaśatapañcāsikā*. Thomas [1903: 2] reconstructs the title: *Sādhanaśatapañcāśat* from the Tibetan materials. Lokesh Chandra [1987: 22] reconstructed the title: *Sādhanaśatapañcāśatka* from the Tibetan materials. Bühnemann points out the titles “*Sādhanaśatapañcāsikā*, *Sādhanaśatapañcāśat*, *Sādhanaśatapañcāśatka*, etc. are only attested to by Bu ston in his Tanjur index. There are many defective parts in this manuscript. It is made of palm leaf. The date is Nepal Saṃvat 285 (1165 A.D.).⁴ It is reprinted by Bühnemann [1994: 61-69].
- (1-3)<C> This is recorded as no. 1593 and titled: *Sāadhanamālātantra* in Bendall [1883]. It is preserved at the University of Cambridge. There is also a title of *Sāadhanamālā* in the colophon. It is made of paper. The date is Nepal Saṃvat 939 (1819 A.D.). Arrangement of *sādhanas* is similar to (1-1) and (1-8).
- (1-4)<N> This is recorded as III.387 in Hara Prasad Śāstri [1915: 83], and titled: *Sāadhanamālā*. The manuscript is preserved at Asiatic Society (Calcutta). It is made of palm leaf, and has few

⁴ The date is Nepal Saṃvat 287 (1167 A.D.) according to the catalogue [Bendall 1883: 174]. But Bhattacharyya [1968b: 93 (note 6)] corrects it as Nepal Saṃvat 285.

errors. Judged from the scripts, the date of the manuscript is considered as the late thirteenth century. This is identical with (4-1).

(1-5)<Ab> This is recorded as no. 111 in Hara Prasad Śāstri [1917]. The manuscript is preserved at the Asiatic Society (Calcutta). It is made of palm leaf. The date seems to be about the twelfth century judged from the scripts. It has unique arrangement of *sādhanas*.

(1-6)<Ba> This is recorded as no. 112 in the catalogue [Hara Prasad Shāstri 1917]. There are letters: *sā* and *mā* on the margin of every page. The letters suggest a title: *Sādhanamālā*. The date is Nepal Samvat 224 (1104 A.D.), but it seems to have been copied about 300 years ago because the scripts belongs to the later period. It begins incompletely in the middle of no. 66 [Bhattacharyya 1968a: 135], and the end is not indicated in the Bhattacharyya edition. Arrangement of *sādhanas* is almost identified with (1-1), (1-3), and (1-4) although some *sādhanas* are omitted. Incomplete.

(1-7)<Na> This is recorded as no. 603 in the old Durbar Library, Kathumandu, Nepal. There is a title: *Sādhanamālā* in a colophon. It is made of paper. There are 150 *sādhanas*. The date is 1958 A.D. Arrangement is identified with (1-1), (1-3), and (1-4).

(1-8)<Nb> This is recorded as III 324 B in the catalogue [Hara Prasad Śāstri 1915: 200-206]. It was preserved at the old Durbar Library. The title: *Sādhanasamuccaya* can be found in a colophon of every *sādhana*. There are 118 folios and 166 *sādhanas*. It has unique arrangement of the *sādhanas*. This is identical with (4-2).

(2) 4 manuscripts are recorded as nos. 451-454 in *A Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in Tokyo University Library* [Matsunami 1965: 161-162, 265-274]. The following explanations are based on the catalogue. Yoshizaki [1979: 15-31] makes clear correlation between the four manuscripts and three kinds of Tibetan translations.

(2-1)No. 451 (old no. 318) is titled: *Sādhanasamuccaya*. It is made of paper, and has 237 folios. There are 14 *sādhanas* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.

- (2-2)No. 452 (old no. 332) is titled: *Sādhanaśamuccaya*, but the other title: *Sādhanaṃālā* is also written in fol. 1a. This seems to be the oldest one of the four manuscripts of the University of Tokyo Library [Yoshizaki 1979: 30]. It is made of paper, and has 168 folios. There are 14 *sādhana*s which cannot be found in the edition.
- (2-3)No. 453 (old no. 443) is titled: *Sādhanaśamuccaya*. This title is twice written in the manuscript. It is made of paper, and has 237 folios. The date is Nepal Saṃvat 752 (1632 A.D.). All these *sādhana*s can be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (2-4)No. 454 (old no. 569) is titled: *Sādhanaśamuccaya*. It is made of paper, and has 23 folios. There is a *sādhana* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (3) 5 manuscripts are recorded as nos. 117-121 in *A Succinct Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the possession of the Faculty of Letters, Kyoto University* [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 35, 40-51]. The following explanations are based on the catalogue and a research of Shimoizumi [1981: 136-137].
- (3-1)No. 117 is titled: *Sādhanaṃālā*. It is made of paper, and has 126 folios and 201 *sādhana*s. Only *sādhana*s after fol. 60a remain. There are seven *sādhana*s which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (3-2)No. 118 is titled: *Sādhanaṃālā*. It is made of paper, and 67 folios and 129 *sādhana*s. There are three *sādhana*s which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (3-3)No. 119 is titled *Sādhanaśāstra*. It is made of paper. It has 354 folios and 301 *sādhana*s. Complete. There are 11 or 12 *sādhana*s which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.⁵ The part from fol. 191b to fol. 310b is old, and the part before fol. 191b and after fol. 310b seems to be added

⁵ According to the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 35, 40-51], there are 13 *sādhana*s which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition. However, it is likely that there are 11 or 12 *sādhana*s which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition for the following reason: In the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 44], *Śraḡdhanyāṃstuti vidhi* is regarded as a work which is not found in the Bhattacharyya edition, but this is identified with no.109 of the Bhattacharyya edition. In the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 51], *śrīMahākālasādhana* is regarded as a work which is not found in the Bhattacharyya edition, but this is also identified with no. 301 of the Bhattacharyya edition. Some short work is written on the margin of fol.191a of the manuscripts: no. 119. This seems not to be found in the Bhattacharyya edition, but the catalogue does not refer to this work. So, one can safely state that the number of works is one or two less than 13 which is suggested in the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983].

afterwards. The date: Nepal Samvat 862 (1742 A.D.) is written on fol. 300a.

(3-4)No. 120 is titled: *Sādhanasamuccaya*. It is made of paper, and has 210 folios and 168 *sādhanas*.⁶ There are nine *sādhanas* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition. At the end of the manuscript, there are some sentences which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.

(3-5)No. 121 is titled: *Sādhanasamuccaya*. It is made of paper, and has 154 folios and about 100 *sādhanas*. There are five *sādhanas* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.⁷

(4) 8 manuscripts are recorded as III. 387 and III. 324 B in the catalogue [Hara Prasad Śāstri 1915: 83-84, 200-206], as nos. 3-387, 4-603, 4-338 and 3-324 in *Nepālarājakīya-Vīrapustakālayasthapustakānām Saṃkṣiptasūcīpatram* [Pūṃnaratnavajrācārya Sāhityaśāstriṇā 1964], as nos. 3-387 and 3-324 in *Nepālarājakīya-Vīrapustakālayasthapustakānām Bṛhatsūcīpatram* [Pūṃnaratnavajrācārya Sāhityaśāstriṇā 1967], as no. pra 1697 kha 2 vi 169, no. ṭṛ 324, no. ṭṛ 387, no. ṭṛ 397-1,⁸ no. ṭṛ 603, no. ṭṛ 693, no. pan 250 and no. C 396 in *A Catalogue of the Buddhist Tantric Manuscripts in the National Archives of Nepal and Kesar Library* [Moriguchi 1989: 134], and as III.324 B and III.387¹ in *A Concordance of H.P. Śāstri's Catalogue of the Durbar Library and the Microfilms of the Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project* [Grünendahl 1989: CIII, LXXXV].

⁶ In the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 35], the number of *sādhanas* is calculated like this. 153(CILVII-CCLIVIII, minus 5, besides, intermittently, 28 before and 8 after)+9=162. '153' means the number of *sādhanas* which are shared with the Bhattacharyya edition. 'CILVII (no. 147)-CCLIVIII (no. 268)' means the numbers of the Bhattacharyya edition [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 35]. '5' means the number of *sādhanas* which are omitted between CILVII and CCLIVIII. '28 before' means there are 28 *sādhanas* before CILVII, and '8 after' means there are 8 *sādhanas* after CCLIVIII. But 33 *sādhanas* are found before CILVII in the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 42]. The catalogue mentions that the manuscript doesn't have no. 59, but a part of it is found in fols. 138b8-139a6. And, the catalogue mentions that the manuscript does not have nos. 22 and 23, but they are found in fols. 166a9-167a6. Further, the catalogue mentions that no. 25 is written in 166a9-167a6, but it is not found in the manuscript. So, we may say that the number of the *sādhanas* becomes 169 as it is 7 more than 162.

⁷ In the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 35], the number of *sādhanas* is calculated like this. 96 (CILVII-CCILVII, minus 5)+2=98. According to this calculation, there are 2 *sādhanas* which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition. But the catalogue [Goshima and Noguchi 1983: 47-48] lists 4 *sādhanas* which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition. So, the number becomes 100.

⁸ Moriguchi [1989: 134] lists this no. as the manuscript of reel no. B24/11. But part of no. 3-387 is recorded in the reel no B 24/11.

(4-1)No. 3-387 is titled: *Sāadhanamālā* or *Sāadhanamālāpañjikāsahitā*.

It is made of palm leaf. This is used in the Bhattacharyya edition: (1-4), but different renderings sometimes are found, compared with the Bhattacharyya edition. According to the catalogue [Hara Prasad Śāstri 1915: 83-84, 264-271], there are 258 folios and 256 *sādhanas* which are divided into two parts. The manuscript is recorded in microfilm on the reel number (B 24/11) according to the Nepal-German manuscript preservation project [Grünendahl 1989: LXXXV].

(4-1-1) Microfilm reel no. A936/15. *Sāadhanamālā* with *pañjikā*. There are 112 folios.

(4-1-2) Microfilm reel no. 24/12. *Sāadhanamālā-pañjikāsahitā*. There are 102 folios.

(4-1-3) Microfilm reel no. 24/11. *Sāadhanamālā*. There are 151 folios and 147 *sādhanas* which correspond with nos. 1-147 of the Bhattacharyya edition. The numbers and arrangement are as follows.

- a) The arrangement is identified with the Bhattacharyya edition, but the *sādhanas*: nos. 16, 24, 31, 42, 43, 74, 82-88, 109 and 116 are omitted.
- b) Nos. 171-189 (fols. 97b2-123a3) are arranged almost in the same order as the Bhattacharyya edition, but nos. 184 and 185 are omitted. No.171 is inserted immediately after no. 188.
- c) Nos. 151-166 (fols. 123a3-132a2) are arranged in the same order as the Bhattacharyya edition, except nos. 159 and 160 are omitted.
- d) Nos. 132-147 (fols. 132a2-146b2) are arranged in the same order as the Bhattacharyya edition.
- e) There are some sentences which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition.

(4-2)No. 3-324 (no. 3-324 B) is titled: *Sāadhanamasuccaya*. This is identical with (1-8).

(4-3)No. 3-603 (Microfilm reel no. A129/2) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā*. Bühnemann [1994: 20] suggests this manuscript is probably identical with the one used by the Bhattacharyya edition ("library register" no. 603): (1-7). However, this suggestion is incorrect because some *sādhanas* which are not included in the Bhattacharyya edition can be found in this manuscript: (4-3). It is made of paper. There are 258 folios. The *sādhanas* from no.

1 to no. 312 are arranged almost in the same order as the Bhattacharyya edition, but the number and arrangement are different from the Bhattacharyya edition as follows:

- a) The following *sādhanas* of the Bhattacharyya edition cannot be found in the manuscript: nos. 16, 28, 42, 43, 74, 95, 128, 160, 184, 185, 190, 240, 254, 267-270, 273, 276-278, 280, 282, 285, 290, 291, 293, 296, 310 and 311.
 - b) There are the following *sādhanas* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition:
 - (i) *Kurukullāvaśyopadeśa* (fol. 139b5-7)⁹
 - (ii) *Śuklavajravārāhīsādhana* (fols. 191b2-192a11)
 - (iii) a work of *Prajñāpramitā* (fols. 250b1-252a10)
 - (iv) *mantras* (fol. 252a10-b4)
 - (v) *Trailokavaśaṅkarāmnāyabhugmalokeśvarasādhana* (fols. 252 b4-255a3)¹⁰
 - (vi) *Samkṣiptaścaḥśutārāsādhana* (fols. 255a3-10)
 - c) Other differences:
 - (i) Nos. 218, 219, 221-226, 228-230, 232, 257, 258, 262 and 263 can be found again in fols. 226a9-238b5.
 - (ii) No. 41 (fols. 28b11-29a7) begins halfway.
 - (iii) No. 142 (fols. 112b9-116b1) ends halfway and is connected with the latter half of no. 143 (fol. 116b1-2).
 - (iv) No. 232 (fol. 237a10-b6) ends halfway and is connected with no. 257.
 - (v) No. 224 (fol. 186a1-3) begins from the latter half.
 - (vi) Nos. 305 and 306 can be found as a work in fol. 255b6-9.
- (4-4)No. 4-338 (Microfilm reel no. B107/22) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā, Sāadhanamālā-tathā-dhāraṇī*,¹¹ or *Sāadhanamālā-tathā-dhāraṇī-saṃgraha* [Moriguchi 1989: 134]. There are 116 folios (97 folios [Moriguchi 1989]). It is made of paper. Incomplete. It has few *sādhanas* and rather different contents from the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (4-5)No. pra 1697 kha 2 vi 169 is titled: *Sāadhanamālā* or *Sādhana-samyccaya*. It is made of palm leaf. There are 5 folios. Incomplete.

⁹ This is identified with the ending of no. 171 of the Bhattacharyya edition. The same work as this is found in (5-1) and (5-3).

¹⁰ The iconographical description has been researched by Sakuma [1999].

¹¹ This is the title attached to the manuscript.

- (4-6)No. tr 693 (Microfilm reel nos. A59/22, A60/1) is titled: *Sādhanamālā* or *Sādhanasamyccaya*. It is made of palm leaf. There are 109 folios.
- (4-7)No. pan 250 (Microfilm reel no. B105/9) is titled: *Sādhanamālā* or *Sādhanasamyccaya*. It is made of paper. There are 133 folios.
- (4-8)No. c 396 (Microfilm reel no. C42/8) is titled: *Sādhanamālā* or *Sādhanasamyccaya*. It is made of paper. There are 357 folios.
- (5) 3 manuscripts: KA 30, CA 26 and DH 201 are recorded in *A Microfilm Catalogue of the Buddhist Manuscripts in Nepal* [Takaoka 1981].
- (5-1) KA 30 (Microfilm reel no. R-KA3) is titled: *Sādhanamālā*.¹² It is made of paper. There are 299 folios and 300 *sādhanas*. Complete. It begins from no. 1 of the Bhattacharyya edition, and the arrangement is almost identical with the Bhattacharyya edition. However, the number and arrangement of *sādhanas* are partially different from the Bhattacharyya edition as follows:
- a) The following *sādhanas* of the Bhattacharyya edition cannot be found: nos. 16, 28, 31, 42, 43, 74, 95, 128, 160, 184, 185, 190, 240, 267 and 304-312.
 - b) There are the following *sādhanas* which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition:
 - (i) *Sukhāvātīlokeśvarasādāna*¹³
 - (ii) *Kurukullāvaśyopadeśah* (fol. 163a1-4)¹⁴
 - (iii) *Kalpoktakurukullāsādhana* (fols. 184a5-186a2)
 - (iv) *Śuklavajravārāhīsādhana* (fols. 217b5-218b6)
 - (v) *Kṛṣṇayamāri* (fol. 269a1-b6)
 - (vi) *Vajramahākālasādhana* (fols. 289a7-290a1)
 - (vii) *Vasudhārābhṭṭārikāyāyakṣasakaṭikā* (fols. 292a5-294b6)
 - (viii) *Varanirmalateja-anakarīyesāgaragṭṭīnidhānakālī* (fols. 294 b6-295a4)¹⁵
 - (ix) The title is not clear (fols. 295a4-297b4).

12 This title is written in the manuscript, but the following letters after the title are illegible.

13 This is written in the margin of fol. 37b.

14 See note 9.

15 In the manuscript (3-3), there is a work (*Varanirmalatejo'nekarīyā sāgaragṭṭīnidhānakar*) which has almost the same title as this (Goshima and Noguchi [1983: 51]).

- (x) *śrīTrailokavaśaṅkarāmnāyabhugmalokeśvarasādhana* (fols. 295a4-298b2)¹⁶
- (xi) *Samkṣiptaścaṣṭutārāsādhana* (fols. 298b2-299a1)
- c) Other differences:
- (i) No. 261 (fols. 249b6-250a5) is followed to no. 263.
- (ii) No. 301 can be found again in fols. 288b5-289a7.
- (5-2) CA26 (Microfilm reel no. R-CA3) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā*. It is made of paper. There are 192 folios. Complete. It begins from no. 1 of the Bhattacharyya edition, and ends in no. 312. The *sādhanas* are arranged almost in the same order as the Bhattacharyya edition, but the number and arrangement are partially different from the Bhattacharyya edition as follows:
- a) The following *sādhanas* of the Bhattacharyya edition cannot be found: nos. 1, 16, 21, 22, 28, 29, 31, 32, 42, 43, 74, 95, 110, 116, 128, 131, 138, 184, 185, 190, 263, 267 and 305.
- b) A work of Kurukullā (fol. 106b5-7) cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition:
- c) Other differences:
- (i) No. 137 (fol. 86a5-b7) ends halfway.
- (ii) No. 141 (fol. 88a2-7) omits the ending.
- (iii) No. 179 (fols. 109b4-110a6) ends halfway and follows to the former half of no. 180.
- (iv) No. 171 (fols. 120b6-122a4) can be found again after no. 188.
- (v) No. 210 (fols. 130a2-131a1) begins halfway.
- (vi) No. 263 follows to no. 261 (fols. 163b5-164a2).
- (vii) No. 279 (fol. 175a1-b2) can be found between nos. 276 and 277. The end of no. 279 is different from the Bhattacharyya edition.
- (viii) Nos. 301 and 300 can be found again in fols. 187a5-188a1.
- (5-3) DH 201 (Microfilm reel no. R-DH5) is titled: *Sādhana-samuccaya*. It is made of paper. There are 186 folios and 168 *sādhanas*. Complete. The original number is written in every *sādhana*. It begins from no. 147 and the arrangement from no. 147 to no. 265 is almost the same as the Bhattacharyya edition. But the number and arrangement are partially different from the Bhattacharyya edition as follows:

¹⁶ The iconographical rendering has been researched by Sakuma [1999]. See note 9.

- a) Nos. 160, 185, 190 and 240 are omitted between no. 147 and no. 265.
- b) There are the following *sādhana*s which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition:
- (i) *Kalpoktakurukullāsādhana* (fols. 40a8-42a7)
 - (ii) *Kurukullāvaśyopadeśa* (fol. 20a1-3)¹⁷
 - (iii) *Sampūtodbhavatantrokatasādhana* (fols. 53a7-54b2)
 - (iv) *Mahābairavasādhana* (fols. 67b8-70b6)
 - (v) *Śuklavajravārāhīsādhana* (fols. 78a5-79a7)
 - (vi) *Āryatārāsādhana* (fol. 164b3-7)
 - (vii) *Vārinidāna-vārijāti-vāridoṣa-vāriḡuṇa-vāriḡiṅga-vāriprā-rambha-praṇāla-vāripramāṇa-droṇa-khāta-vāridigdhārā-nāga-maṇḡala-nāgamantra-nāgaktiyā-ārāma-phala-teṣām sādhanā* (fols. 170b7-179b4)
 - (viii) a work of Nāga (fols. 179b4-186b5)
- c) The following *sādhana*s of the Bhattacharyya edition can be found in fols. 114a6-170b7 in this order: nos. 3, 289, 287, 281, 60, 59,¹⁸ 60, 61, 69, 277, 279, 44, 51, 151, 80, 56, 66, 28, 6, 29, 16, 35, 14, 37, 22, 23, 73, 122, 71, 72, 184, 174, 271, 278, 267, 45, 56, 295, 287, 74, 75, 92,¹⁹ 89, 91, 137, 138, 129, 136, 134 and 280.
- d) Other differences:
- (i) The name of the author of a colophon of no.181 is added to the beginning of no.182 (fols. 34b5-35b8).
 - (ii) No. 261 (fols. 109b8-110a7) follows to no. 263.
- (6) 2 manuscripts are preserved at the National Library, Paris. Mallmann [1964: 13, 187-215] edits *sādhana*s of -Mañjuśrī section by using them. The following explanations are based on *Catalogue du Fonds Sanscrit*, Fascicule I [Filliozat 1941: 91-92].
- (6-1) Sanskrit 151 is titled: *Sādhanamālā*. It is made of paper. There are 173 fols. The date is Nepal Saṃvat 956 (= 1836 A.D.).
- (6-2) Sanskrit 152 is titled: *Sādhanamālā*. It is identified with the manuscript: Dev(anāgarī) 123 referred by Foucher [1905: 6-7].

¹⁷ See note 9.

¹⁸ It begins from halfway.

¹⁹ *Āryatārāsādhana* (fol.164b3-7) which is not found in the Bhattacharyya edition is inserted between no. 92 and no. 89.

It is made of paper. There are 193 folios. The date is the 19th century A.D.

- (7) 3 manuscripts are preserved at the University of Cambridge. Two of them: (1-2) and (1-3) are used in the Bhattacharyya edition.

(7-1) Add. 1648 is titled: *Sādhanaśamuccaya*. It is made of palm leaf. There are 228 folios. The date is the year 336 in the reign of King Alimalladeva (1216 A.D.).²⁰

Foucher [1905: 16-100] edits and translates the iconographical description of the *sādhanaś* by using the three manuscripts and (6-2). On the other hand, Thomas [1903: 1-42] makes clear correlation between the three manuscripts and two kinds of Tibetan translations.

- (8) Finot [1934: 1-86] edits and translates a manuscript which includes nos. 217, 252 and 253 of the Bhattacharyya edition in "Manuscripts Sanscrits de *Sādhanaś* retrouvés en Chine", *Journal Asiatique*, tome 225. The manuscript is found by H. Maspero in a Chinese temple, P'ou-ngan sseu (普安寺). It is made of palm leaf. The temple record says that the monk, Paotchang, had brought it with him from India in 1057 A.D. (宋嘉祐二年) [Yamada 1959: 206][Koetsuka 1967: 72].

- (9) 2 manuscripts are preserved at Asiatic Society (Bombay) [Bhattacharyya 1968b: preface XIV]. The following explanations are based on references of Bühnemann [1994: 19] and our research.

(9-1) Buddhist MSS-16 BI 203 is titled: *Sādhanaśmālā*. There are 44 folios. Complete. It is made of paper. The date is Nepal Śamvat 993 (1873 A.D.).

(9-2) Buddhist MSS-17 BI 207 is titled: *Sādhanaśmālā*. There are 44 folios. Complete. It is made of paper. The date is Nepal Śamvat 993 (1873 A.D.).

- (10) 3 manuscripts were preserved at old Bir Library. The manuscripts recorded as no. 209 in *the Buddhist Manuscripts of the Bir Library* [Sanskrit Seminar of Taisho University 1955: 75]. Two of them: (4-2) and (4-6) can be found in the National Archives of Nepal.

²⁰ The date is verified by the calendar [Petech 1984: 81]. Bendall [1883: 154-155] reads the date as the year 336, but points out a possibility of 226 as well. Foucher [1905: 6] reads 336 as 226.

- (10-1) The another manuscript except (4-2) and (4-6) is titled: *Sāadhanamālā-prathamakhaṇḍa*. It is made of paper. There are 177 folios.
- (11) A manuscript is preserved at China Library of Nationalities (Beijing). This is recorded as Manuscript 140. Bühnemann [1994: 37-58] reprints it, and makes clear the number and arrangement of *sādhanas*. As the manuscript lacks a colophon, its title cannot be known. Bühnemann [1994: 31] gives a name: *Sādhanaśataka* which is attested by Bu ston, the *Blue Annals* and the later Tibetan tradition. It is made of palm leaf. There are 40 folios and 90 *sādhanas*.
- (12) 2 manuscripts are preserved at the Institute of Advanced Studies of World Religion (New York) [Bühnemann 1994: 21]. They are recorded as MBB-I-123 and MBB-II-43 in *Buddhist Sanskrit Manuscripts: A Title List of the Microfilm Collection of the Institute of Advanced Studies of World Religion*, 1975. The explanations (12-1) and (12-2) which after follow are based on a research of the Microfilm Project of the Institute of Advanced Studies of World Religion.
- (12-1) MBB-I-123 is titled: *Sāadhanamālā*. It is made of paper, and is copied in Nepal Saṃvat 757 (1637 A.D.). There are 310 folios and 38 *sādhanas*. Complete.
- (12-2) MBB-II-43 is titled: *Sādhanasamuccaya*. It is made of paper. There are 186 folios. 167 folios are lost. The date is not clear.
- (13) A manuscript is preserved at Melville Memorial Library (the State University of New York). Meisezahl [1980: 136-157] edits and translates two *sādhanas* by using this manuscript. The date is Nepal Saṃvat 747 (= 1627 A.D.).
- (14) A manuscript is preserved at Bodleian Library (the University of Oxford) [Bühnemann 1994: 21]. It is recorded as no. 1455-Ms. Sansk. c. 16 (R) in *Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Bodleian Library*, Vol. 2 begun by M. Winternitz, continued and completed by A.B. Keith, Oxford, 1905. It is titled: *Sāadhanamālātantra*, and is made of palm leaf. The date is the 14th century A.D. (?). Incomplete.

III. Conclusion

- (a) We have been able to succeed in locating the thirty-eight manuscripts all over the world, and eight of these manuscripts are used by the Bhattacharyya edition. The numbers and arrangements of *sādhanas* in the four manuscripts of the University of Tokyo and the five of Kyoto University are shown in the studies of Matsunami [1965], Shimoizumi [1981], Goshima and Noguchi [1983].

The iconographical description of two manuscripts of the National Library in Paris are edited by Mallmann [1964]. Three manuscripts of the University of Cambridge are edited and translated by Foucher [1905] with one of the manuscripts of the National Library in Paris about the iconographical description of the *sādhanas*. Two of the three manuscripts of the University of Cambridge are used by the Bhattacharyya edition, and one of the two is reprinted by Bühnemann [1994]. Bühnemann also published a manuscript of China Library of Nationalities (Beijing). Finot [1905] edits and translates the three *sādhanas* by using a manuscript found in a Chinese temple.

- (b) Ten manuscripts: (1-2), (1-4), (1-5), (4-1), (4-5), (4-6), (7-1), (8), (11) and (14) are made of palm leaf among the thirty-eight manuscripts.
- (c) (3-3) and (5-1) are not used in the Bhattacharyya edition, and are made of paper. As the number and arrangement of the *sādhanas* are almost identical to each other, the close relationship between them can be pointed out. On the other hand, (3-4) and (5-3) are not used in the Bhattacharyya edition, and are made of paper. The number and arrangement of the *sādhanas* correspond with each other. So, two manuscripts, (3-4) and (5-3), are regarded as copies of the same manuscript.
- (d) Among the manuscripts which are not used in the Bhattacharyya edition or which are unpublished, some have most of *sādhanas* in the Bhattacharyya edition, but others do not. The manuscripts which have most of *sādhanas* in the Bhattacharyya edition are (4-3), (5-1) and (5-2). The manuscript which does not have most of *sādhanas* in the Bhattacharyya edition is (5-3). Among them, there

are eleven²¹ *sādhana*s at most which cannot be found in the Bhattacharyya edition.

- (e) The manuscripts: (2-1), (2-2), (2-3), (2-4), (3-1), (3-2), (3-3), (3-4), (3-5), (4-3), (5-1), (5-2), (5-3) and (11) are not used in the Bhattacharyya edition. Among them, the manuscripts whose *sādhana*s are all included in the Bhattacharyya edition are (2-3) and (11). On the other hand, the manuscripts whose *sādhana*s are not always found in the Bhattacharyya edition are (2-1), (2-2), (2-4), (3-1), (3-2), (3-3), (3-4), (3-5), (4-3), (5-1), (5-2) and (5-3). The number of the latter manuscripts is more than the former. However, the latter type do not have so many *sādhana*s which are not found in the Bhattacharyya edition as mentioned in the preceding section.

As far as investigating these fourteen manuscripts, it is reasonable to conclude that the Bhattacharyya edition can still be regarded as the standard text.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bhattacharyya, Benoytosh
 1968a (1924) *The Indian Buddhist Iconography*, Calcutta: Firma K.L. Mukhopadhyay. (Reprint of Second Edition 1958, Revised and Enlarged with 357 Illustrations)
 1968b (1925, 1928) *The Sāghanamālā*, 2 Vols., Gaekwad's Oriental Series 26, 41, Baroda: Oriental Institute.
- Bendall, C.
 1883 *Catalogue of the Buddhist Sanskrit Manuscripts in the University Library, Cambridge*, Cambridge: The University Press.
- Bühnemann, Gudrun (compiled)
 1994 **Sādhanaśataka and *Sādhanaśatapañcaśikā Two Buddhist Sādhana Collections in Sanskrit Manuscript*, Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde Heft 32, Wien: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien Universität Wien.
- Finot, L.
 1999 "Manuscripts Sanskrits de Sādhana's retrouvé en Chine", *Journal Asiatique* 225: 1-85.
- Filliozat, Jean
 1941 *Catalogue du Fonds Sanscrit*, Fascicule I, Paris.
- Foucher, A.
 1900, 1905 *Étude sur l'Iconographie Bouddhique de l'Inde*, Bibliothèque de l'École des Hautes Études Sciences Religieuses Treizième volume 2^e partie, Paris: Ernst Leroux, Édition.
- Goshima, Kiyotaka and Keiya Noguchi (compiled)
 1983 *A Succinct Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Possession of the Faculty of Letters, Kyoto University*, Kyoto.
- Grünendahl, Reinhold
 1989 *A Concordance of H.P. Śāstri's Catalogue of the Durbar Library and the Microfilms of the Nepal-German Manuscript Preservation Project*, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden GMBH.

21 This is based on (5-1).

- Hara Prasād Shāstri, Mahāmahopādhyāya (ed.)
 1915 *A Catalogue of Palm-leaf & Selected Paper MSS. belonging to the Durbar Library, Nepal*, Vol. 2, Calcutta: The Baptist Mission Press.
 1917 *A Descriptive Catalogue of Sanscrit Manuscripts in the Government Collection Under the Care of the Asiatic Society of Bengal*, Vol. I: Buddhist Manuscripts, Calcutta.
- Koetsuka Takashi
 1967 "Meiso to Zokei", *Nanto Bukkyo* (Journal of the Nanto Society for Buddhist Studies), 20: 60-79. (in Japanese)
- Lokesh Chandra
 1987 *Buddhist Iconography newly revised and enlarged edition*, 2 Vols. Śata-Piṭaka Series Vol. 342, New Delhi: Aditya Prakashan.
- Mallmann, Marie-Thérèse de
 1948 *Introduction a l'Étude d'Avalokiteśvara*, Ministère de l'Éducation Nationale Annales du Musée Guimet Bibliothèque d'Étude - Tome Cinquante-Septième, Paris: Civilisations du Sud.
 1964 *Étude Iconographique sur Mañjuśrī*, Paris: École Française d'Extrême-Orient Vol. 55.
- Matsunami, Seiren (ed.)
 1965 *The Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts of the Tokyo University Library*, Tokyo: Suzuki Research Foundation.
- Meisezahl, R.O.
 1980 *Geist und Ikonographie des Vajrayāna-Buddhismus*, Beiträge Zentralasienforschung Band 2, Sankt Augustin: VGH Wissenschaftsverlag.
- Mori, Masahide
 1992 "The Sādhana Practice of Mahāmāyā", *The Mikkyo Zuzo* (Journal of the Buddhist Iconography) 11: 23-43. (in Japanese)
- Moriguchi, Mitsutoshi
 1989 *A Catalogue of the Buddhist Tantric Manuscripts in the National Archives of Nepal and Kesar Library*, Tokyo: Sankibou Busshorin.
- Nihom, M.
 1992 "The Goddess with the Severed Head: a recension of Sādhanamālā 232, 234 and 238 attributed to the Siddhācārya Virūpā", *Ritual, State and History in South Asia*. edited by A.W. Van Den Hoek, D.H.A. Kloff, M.S. Oort, Leiden/New York/Köln: E.J. Brill.
- Okuyama, Naoji
 1988 "Two Problems Relating to the Development of the Buddhist Pantheon in Tibet", *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 36(2): 94-100. (in Japanese)
 1998 "On Sādhanaśataka", *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 46 (2): 914-919. (in Japanese)
- Petech, Luciano
 1984 (1958) *Mediaeval History of Nepal*, Serie Orientale Roma 54, Roma: Is.M.E.O.
- Pūrṇaratnavajrācārya Sāhityaśāstrinā (ed.)
 1964 *Nepālarājākīya-Vīrapustakālayasthahastalikhitasamastapustakānām Saṃkṣiptasūcī-patram*. Purātattvapraśāsanamālā 18, Kāṭhmāṇḍhū: Virapustakālaya.
 1967 *Nepālarājākīya-Vīrapustakālayasthahastalikhitasamastapustakānām Bṛhatsūcī-patram*, Purātattva-prakāśanamālā 39, Kāṭhmāṇḍhū: Virapustakālaya.
- Sakuma, Ruriko
 1990a "The Sanskrit Manuscripts of the Sādhanamālā", *Tokai-Bukkyo* (Journal of Tokai Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies) 35: 88-103. (in Japanese)
 1990b "Iconographical Material for the Study of Tantric Buddhism in India (1): The Sādhanas of Siṃhanāda-Avalokiteśvara in the Sādhanamālā", *Bulletin of the National Museum of Ethnology* 15(2): 511-564. (in Japanese)
 1991 "On the Sādhanas of Avalokiteśvara expounded in the Sādhanamālā", *The Mikkyo Zuzo* (Journal of the Buddhist Iconography) 10: 1-16. (in Japanese)
 1993 "Jñānasattva and Samayasattva in the Sādhanamālā", *Indogaku Mikkyogaku Kenkyū: Miyasaka Yūsho Hakase Kokikinen Ronbunshū* (Indology and Esoteric Buddhism: Prof. Dr. Yusho Miyasaka Felicitation Volume), Kyoto: Hozokan, pp.793-807. (in Japanese)
 1995 "Kasarupanasejizajojuho no wayaku kaisetsu" (A Translation of sādhanas of Khasarpana Lokeśvara), *Nanto Bukkyo* (Journal of the Nanto Society for Buddhist Studies) 71: 13-28. (in Japanese)
 1996 "A Study of Visualization on Śaḍakṣarī Lokeśvara", *Tokai-Bukkyo* (Journal of Tokai Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies) 41: 83-94. (in Japanese)

THE SĀDHANAMĀLĀ

- 1998 “Visualisation based on the Teaching of the *Kāraṇḍavyūha*: A Study of Visualization on Śaḍakṣari Lokeśvara (II)”, *Tokai-Bukkyo* (Journal of Tokai Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies) 43: 103-116. (in Japanese)
- 1999 “An Introduction to a Study of Avalokiteśvara in India and Nepal: Expressions of generosity and appeasement on the Iconography of Trailokyavaśaṅkara Lokeśvara”, *The Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Research Association* 64: 91-104. (in Japanese)
- 2000 A Study of the *Avalokiteśvaras* in the *Sādhnamālā*, D.Lit. dissertation, Nagoya University. (in Japanese)
- Sanskrit Seminar of Taisho University
- 1955 “Buddhist Manuscripts of the Bir Library”, *Memoirs of Taisho University* 40: 55-84. (in Japanese)
- Shimizu, Tadashi
- 1977 “Dhyāna (image) and Religious Observance in the *Sādhnamālā*”, *The Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Research Association* 43: 59-72. (in Japanese)
- Shimoizumi, Zengyo
- 1981 “On the Kyoto University Manuscript of the *Sādhnamālā*”, *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 30(1): 136-137. (in Japanese)
- Takaoka, Hidenobu.(ed.)
- 1981 *A Microfilm Catalogue of the Buddhist Manuscripts in Nepal*, Vol. 1, Nagoya: Buddhist Library.
- Thomas, F.W.
- 1903 “Deux collections sanscrites et tibetaines de Sādhnanas”, *Le Museon* 4: 1-42.
- Tsakamoto, Keisho, Yukei Matsunaga and Hirofumi Isoda (ed.)
- 1989 *A Descriptive Bibliography of the Sanskrit Buddhist Literature*, Vol. 4, The Buddhist Tantra. Kyoto: Herakuji shoten. (in Japanese)
- Yamada, Ryūjo
- 1959 *Bongo butten no shobunken: daijobukkyoseiritsujosetsu shiryohen*, Kyoto: Heirakuji shoten. (in Japanese)
- Yamaguchi, Shinobu
- 1997 “The Saptākṣaramantra of Saṃvara: *Sādhnamālā* 251”, *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies* 46(1): 398-404. (in Japanese)
- Yoshizaki, Kazumi
- 1979 “A Critical Study of the *Sādhnamālā* (1)”, *Bulletin of the Graduate School, Toyo University Graduate Program of Liberal Arts* 16:15-31. (in Japanese)

Research Fellow
The Eastern Institute
Tokyo