報告番号 \* 第 主 文 旨  $\mathcal{O}$ Connectivity and Interdependence: Social 論文題目 Network Analysis of Community Tourism in Pamilacan Island, the Philippines **BULILAN Carl Milos Ruchina** 氏 名

## 文 内 容 論 $\mathcal{O}$ 旨

This dissertation has provided a new approach in analyzing the organizing activities of villagers engaged in community tourism livelihood. Using a network perspective, this study has explored the role of social networks in addressing the problems of resource scarcity, internal conflicts, and competition in maintaining collective touristic enterprises. Tourism is one of the biggest industries in the world contributing to economic growth of developing countries. However, local communities in those destinations started to experience the negative effects of touristic activities happening in their backyards. Villagers have been marginalized from the industry, displaced from their own lands, and lost control over their own natural resources and cultural identities.

Government and development agencies have adopted community-based tourism (CBT) as a mechanism to address the above issues and, at the same time, as a strategy for local development. CBT aims to organize community-owned and -managed touristic enterprises as a means for local participation, generation of income, and community empowerment. In spite of the lack of success in the field and the criticism from scholars, organizing agencies continue to advocate and invest in community tourism programs in developing countries. As a result, formally initiated community tourism organizations collapse, internal conflicts arise, and resources are wasted.

The main issue of community tourism is how to make villagers able to actively participate in and benefit from the touristic activities in their vicinities. Earlier studies have examined the necessary attributes for the "success" of community-owned touristic enterprises. However, these conditions appear to be too demanding considering the given local socio-economic context. Critics have pointed to the stratified character of communities and the scarcity of local resources as the main hindrances for villagers to participate in the tourism industry. Villagers in developing countries experience internal disagreements and the lack of financial and technical capacities that make collective touristic businesses difficult to maintain unless the supporting agencies would continue to provide the locals with endless resources.

Focusing on formally initiated CBT organizations, earlier studies have not given attention to how local people have been able to maintain a touristic livelihood outside formal arrangements, in spite of their given circumstances. Villagers employ social connections in order to gain access to resources which they do not have and in order to organize themselves for touristic services. Social networks are essential elements of "community" and "tourism" because both phenomena involve social interactions which determine social relations and business transactions. Not giving attention to existing social networks results in an incomplete understanding of the dynamics of community tourism.

Using a network perspective, this study has treated community tourism as a network phenomenon, analyzed social interactions embedded within a wider network composed of interacting actors engaging in different forms of interactions. The properties of interactions with the attributes of the actors determine the life of the organizing activities and the achievement of collective goods. This present study combined structural analysis with examining the attributes of actors and retelling local narratives triangulated with secondary literature and official documents. In understanding the organizing behaviors of people in the village, this study also borrowed conceptual categories from the moral economy and the political economy perspectives and from Elinor Ostrom's idea of self-organization.

The study employed the case of Pamilacan community tourism, a pilot CBT project in the Philippines. In spite of the support from government and non-government agencies, the formal CBT collapsed. This dissertation covered the period from the organizing of the project in 1997/98, to the collapse of the government-NGO-sponsored CBT organization, to the emergence of informal touristic transactions until 2014. In particular, this study asked the following questions: (1) Why did the formal organizing structures in Pamilacan community tourism collapse? (2) Faced with internal conflicts, lack of local resources, and strong competition, how do villagers remain embedded within and benefit from the touristic network, despite the collapse of formal organizing structures? (3) What are the types of networks that maintain community tourism? And, what wider implications can be generated from the case of Pamilacan?

This dissertation has argued on the following. The government-NGO-sponsored CBT in Pamilacan collapsed because of the failure of its organizing structure to expand marketing and business networks which led to exhaustion of resources. Formal organizing activities depended heavily on the material and marketing supports from the organizing agencies, thus after the organizing stage ended resources started to drain. With the lack of finances and the declining income due to growing external competitors from Panglao Island, the formal organization could no longer maintain its touristic services, nor provide incentives for cooperating villagers.

Faced with the above challenges, the formal organization chose to retain its organizing

structures and depended solely on its own resources in managing and marketing its services, but failed because of the lack of finances and technical know-how. This led to the declining number of their guests, and thus to the lowering income which triggered discontentment among its members, until the organization and its leadership became dysfunctional.

Despite of the collapse of the formal organization, villagers were able to continue to operate collective touristic livelihood. By reconfiguring their social networks, they were able to address the lack of local resources, internal conflicts, and competition. Informal transactions generated an emergent organizing system which does not have a formal leadership, roles, and rules, but interconnections among people of different intentions. The wider emergent network facilitates the flow of information and benefits from clients to local service providers. This enabled villagers to gain access to resources, build mutual support, and thereby benefit from the local tourism industry with lesser cost.

Furthermore, Pamilacan islanders were also able to maintain central positions in the wider touristic network through their informal direct connections and strategic position between the other actors. Thus, through this emergent network, locals continue to be embedded within the wider touristic industry and thereby secure control over their own natural resources, avoid isolation from the local industry, and strengthen their community ties.

The organizing activities in Pamilacan revealed three forms of networks that built up the structure maintaining community tourism: the enabling network, the business and marketing networks, and the mutual support system. The enabling network involving government agencies, NGOs, and the local people channeled material and technical support from the supporting agencies to the community to compensate for the lack of local resources to engage in collective touristic services. Although this network alone was not enough to sustain the formal CBT enterprise, it opened up opportunities and trigged the interest of the locals for the touristic livelihood.

Business and marketing networks involved private businesses, tourists, and the local people that facilitated the transactions with clients, the provision of services, and the generation of income. These ties emerged from informal arrangements after the collapse of the formal organization. Through these networks, the cost of transaction on the part of the villagers is lessened because the tour agents and the bridging locals handle the marketing of the community touristic services.

The mutual support system is the given socio-economic relationships among villagers in the community that secures cooperation. Even before the coming of tourism, traditional support systems have sustained the local people's livelihood, particularly their hunting activities. Now, the sense of mutual support has been revitalized in collective touristic livelihood. The three forms of networks have become the building blocks maintaining the local industry that is both social and economic in nature.

The case of Pamilacan can be situated within the wider discussion on community organizing in the village context, and in particular concerning community tourism. Today, with the advancements in transportation and communication technologies, villagers can now have easy access to outsiders making communication, transactions, and outsourcing fast and far reaching. Social networking has become an essential aspect in the organizing activities of people in formerly isolated localities. Thus, this dissertation sees its contribution to the wider debate on community organizing by emphasizing the social network dimension.

In particular, this study argues on the crucial role of social networks in community tourism activities in the context of developing countries. The case of Pamilacan showed the villager's capacity to overcome the problems of heterogeneity and scarcity of resources in order to engage in touristic enterprises even outside the formal arrangements through constructing new affiliations and restructuring social networks in order to gain access to resources.

This study also has practical implications. CBT organizers and policy makers should work together with villagers, not only in providing the initial capital and technology, but also in the structuring of networks with the other actors in the industry. Ties with private businesses and bridging actors (private individuals or institutions) should be strengthened to link the community with the wider touristic system. Structures need to be flexible to encourage the widening of the ties with the other stakeholders. Governments should assist by providing legislative mechanisms that protect the CBT industries.

The experience of Pamilacan also reminds us of the wider issue of clientelism. In traditional societies, power relations are determined by the resource capacity of people. The phenomenon of networking communities opens up new access to resources beyond local boundaries. With the modern means of communication and transportation, poorer people now have wider options to outsource the capital they needed without necessarily depending on local patrons. This wider access to resources through networking decentralized power relations and has generated new types of interdependency.

To assist future studies analyzing community tourism and collective actions involving villagers, this dissertation also offered the T-A-P-E tool. However, since this is a single case study, there is a need for comparative investigations, between organizing structures of long enduring formally initiated CBTs and the organizing structures similar to that of Pamilacan, to test the present conclusions. Furthermore, a detailed examination of quantitative data would be of help.

Lastly, the case of Pamilacan reminds us that connectivity and interdependence have sustained basic social institutions from which more complex social systems could gain insight.