

BOOK REVIEW

cchāyām upakṣaya ... iti (K. Bhattacharya);
atra Bhāṭṭācāryāḥ 'sarpādīnā ...' iti paṭhanti (Miśra).
atra mūle kiñ ca śarīrajanyatvaṃ viśiṣṭan tadabhāvaṃ viśiṣaṣṭīti mudritapustakeṣu
pāṭhaḥ. prakṛtas tu pāṭha Upādhyāyasammata Upādhiprābhāyām Upādhiprābhāyām api
samupalabhyamānatvāt (K. Bhattacharya);
kiñ ca śarīrajanyatvaṃ ... iti Cintāmaṇau pāṭhaḥ. kin tu uparitamāḥ (sic) pāṭhaḥ
Upādhyāyasammato bhavitum arhati. Upādhiprābhāyām api tathaiva pāṭho vidyate
(Miśra);
....
ata ūrdhvaṃ Prabhā na labhyate (K. Bhattacharya);
ita ūrdhvaṃ Prabhā na labhyate (Miśra).

Paris

Kamaleswar BHATTACHARYA

François Voegetti, Vincent Eltschinger, Danielle Feller, Maria P. Candotti, Bogdan Diaconescu, and Malhar Kulkarni (eds.), *Devadattīyam: Johannes Bronkhorst Felicitation Volume*, Worlds of South and Inner Asia 5, Bern / Berin / Bruxelles / Frankfurt am Main / New York / Oxford / Wien: Peter Lang, 2012, xiv + 847 Pp. SFR 119.00. (Hardback)

This collection of thirty-two high-quality articles is dedicated to Professor Johannes Bronkhorst on his retirement from teaching at University of Lausanne in 2011. According to the foreword by the editors, the title *Devadattīyam* is named after “Devadatta,” which is equivalent to “Johannes,” from the Hebrew “*Yōḥānnān*,” roughly corresponding to “God’s grace.” “Devadatta” is the most familiar proper name for all Sanskrit scholars and students, especially for those who struggle with intricate discussions of Pāṇinian grammar. Many grammatical examples are used in which Devadatta usually cooks rice, in order to illustrate good Sanskrit. With the affix *cha* (“-īya”) at the end of the word, the title aptly describes that this volume is “relating to Johannes.”

The acknowledgements and foreword by the editors are followed by an introductory article titled “Johannes Bronkhorst and Indian Studies,” by JAN E.M. HOUBEN. This article briefly sketches Professor Bronkhorst’s life, and readers will be interested in how skillfully his karma led him to Pune, where he absorbed abundant knowledge of Sanskrit, both scholastically from university professors and traditionally from learned pandits.

The articles are thematically distributed into seven sections representing various fields or topics within Indological Studies. The diversity of the volume certainly reflects Professor Bronkhorst’s interests and achievements, which are incredibly deep and wide for a solo Indologist. Since it is difficult to summarize such a diverse volume with my limited ability in this limited space, here I will only cite the titles and author’s names of the thirty-two articles.

A section on *Grammar* comes first, as this was the field in which Professor Bronkhorst first became renowned. This section contains eight articles: “Naming-Procedure and Substitution in Early Sanskrit Grammarians” (MARIA PIERA CANDOTTI), “Pāṇini and Padakāras” (GEORGE CARDONA), “Yāska’s Treatment of

Verb *vis-à-vis* Noun: Will the Verbal Noun Please Stand up?” (ABHIJIT GHOSH), “On the *bahiraṅga*-Rule in Pāṇinian Grammar: Nāgeśa and Nārāyaṇa” (JAN E. M. HOUBEN), “Bhartṛhari and the Tradition: *karmapravacanīya*” (EIVIND KAHR), “Derivation of the Declension of *yuṣmad* and *asmad* in Cāndra Vyākaraṇa” (MALHAR KULKARNI, ANUJA AJOTIKAR & TANUJA AJOTIKAR), “Cāndriana Inedita (Studien zum Cāndravvyākaraṇa V)” (THOMAS OBERLIES), and “Patañjali’s View of a Sentence Meaning and Its Acceptance by Bhartṛhari” (HIDEYO OGAWA). Just as the above article by J. HOUBEN here considers the subject of Professor Bronkhorst’s Ph.D. thesis at the University of Poona in 1979, many articles in this section are directly related to Professor Bronkhorst’s work.

The second section, *Philosophy*, contains six articles: “Authorship of the Saṅkarṣa-kāṇḍa” (ASHOK AKLUJKAR), “Once Again on the Desires of the Buddha” (ELI FRANCO), “Ontology of Relations. The Approach of Navya Nyāya” (VASHISHTA NARAYAN JHA), “Wise Men and Ascetics. Indian Philosophy and Philosophers in Classical Antiquity” (KLAUS KARTTUNEN), “Studies in Utpaladeva’s Īśvarapratyabhijñā-vivṛti. Part V: Self-Awareness and Yogic Perception” (RAFFAELE TORELLA), and “Śāśadhara on Invariable Concomitance (*vyāpti*) (1)” (TOSHIHIRO WADA). The various provenances of the contributors in this section, that is, Canada, Germany, India, Finland, Italy, and Japan, is typical of how this volume comprehensively includes the latest achievements in Indological studies from all over the world. It also reflects the breadth of Professor Bronkhorst’s circle of friends and influence.

The third section, *Vedic Studies*, consists of four articles: “On the Particle *hi* in the Ṛgveda” (JOEL P. BRERETON), “Vedas and Their Śākhās: Contested Relationships” (MADHAV M. DESHPANDE), “The Anupadasūtra of Sāmaveda and Jaimini: Prolegomena to a Forthcoming Edition and Translation” (ASKO PARPOLA), and “Vedic Accent: Underlying versus Surface” (PETER M. SCHARF).

The fourth section, *Buddhism*, comprises five articles: “Debate, Salvation and Apologetics. On the Institutionalization of Dialectics in the Buddhist Monastic Environment” (VINCENT ELTSCHINGER), “Small-Scale Buddhism” (HARRY FALK), “On Reading the Lives of the Jinās. Questions and Answers of Medieval Monks” (PHYLLIS GRANOFF), “Bhāviveka, Dharmakīrti and Kumāriḷa” (HELMUT KRASSER), and “The Buddhist Nun as an Urban Landlord and a ‘Legal Person’ in Early India” (GREGORY SCHOPEN). Two of the articles in this section are each over sixty pages long. In this volume, the articles seem to have little length restriction. In consequence, readers can enjoy a variety of voluminous discussions, instead of simply observing previews of the full-fledged studies, as we oftentimes see in essay collections of this kind.

Three articles on *Dharmaśāstra* and *Arthaśāstra* constitute the fifth section: “Imagination, croyance et gouvernement des hommes. Note sur l’Arthaśāstra” (CHARLES MALAMOU), “Kaṇṭakaśodhana. Courts of Criminal Justice in Ancient India” (PATRICK OLIVELLE), and “Kumāriḷa and Medhātithi on the Authority of Codified Sources of *dharma*” (KIYOTAKA YOSHIMIZU).

The sixth section contains five articles on *Epics and Purāṇas*: “*Sthavira-buddhayaḥ* in the Mārkaṇḍeyasamāsyaparvan of the Mahābhārata. Problems in

Locating Critiques of Buddhism in the Mahābhārata” (GREGORY BAILEY), “The Rāmāyaṇa in the Purāṇas” (JOHN BROCKINGTON), “The Rāmāyaṇa in the Purāṇas” (MARY BROCKINGTON), “Two Tales of Vanishing Wives. Sītā’s Trials Reconsidered in the Light of the Story of Saraṇyū” (DANIELLE FELLER), and “Philosophy’s ‘Wheel of Fire’ (*alātacakra*) and Its Epic Background” (JAMES L. FITZGERALD). Readers might be surprised to know that the Department of Oriental Languages and Cultures (Section de langues et civilisations orientales) of the University of Lausanne, where Professor Bronkhorst was a professor since 1987, ceased to exist soon after his retirement. The webpage of the university states that the department was merged with the Slavonic and South Asian Languages and Cultures (Section de langues et civilisations slaves et de l’Asie du Sud). Among the contributors, D. FELLER and M. CANDOTTI, who are also the editors of this volume and have written articles in this section and the first section respectively, have succeeded Professor Bronkhorst and continued teaching Sanskrit and Indological studies, along with other staff members in the new department.

Finally, the last section, *Other Topics*, is made up of two items that do not fall into other categories: “A Note on Manuscripts in the S. P. Pandit Collection” (IRAWATI KULKARNI & MALHAR KULKARNI), and “Johannes Bronkhorst: An Ongoing Bibliography” (THE EDITORS). This bibliography is one of the biggest features of this volume, and is more than twenty pages long. It provides readers not only with bibliographical details of Professor Bronkhorst’s publications but also their URLs (the address of publications that are available on the Internet). Readers can locate and download most of Professor Bronkhorst’s articles and even several of his books from the Internet. With this information, readers can access the achievements of this academic giant of our era very conveniently: this is almost on a level with obtaining a fine Indological Encyclopedia authored by a prominent individual for free. Incidentally, here I will mention a small piece of information that can be noted in addition to the bibliography: one of his 2006 articles, “The Context of Indian Philosophy,” has also been published in a book, *Indian Philosophy and Text Science* (ed. by T. Wada, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 2010, pp. 9–30), with eight articles by other scholars. This is based on a proceedings of a small conference held at Nagoya University in December 2005. It was a great pleasure for us to welcome Professor Bronkhorst to this conference as a guest speaker.

On a more personal note, I first met Professor Bronkhorst at the Bhartrhari conference, which was held at the University of Poona, in January 1992. For us, students at the Department of Sanskrit and Prakrit Languages from outside India, Professor Bronkhorst was an icon, being the best-known senior figure who had studied there as a student. He has continued to be an icon and a precursor not only for us who studied at Pune but also for many Indologists all over the world from then until now. I hope he will continue to be so in the future.

Nagoya University

Toshiya UNEBE
