

# THE “DISCOURSE ON VERBAL SUFFIXES” (ĀKHYĀTAVĀDA) OF RAGHUNĀTHA ŚIROMAṆI (1)

Toshihiro WADA

## Introduction

Navya-Nyāya was founded by Udayana, who was active in the 11th century, and its system was consolidated by Gaṅgeśa in the 14th century.<sup>1</sup> Navya-nyāya contributed a great deal not only to Indian epistemology and logic, but also to Sanskrit semantics. The period between Udayana and Gaṅgeśa, which Wada [2000] designates as ‘early Navya-nyāya’, has not received much attention by scholars. However, it is well known that Gaṅgeśa influenced the semantic arguments made by later teachers in the Mīmāṃsā and Vyākaraṇa schools. The post-Gaṅgeśa period of Navya-nyāya came to a culmination with Raghunātha Śiromaṇi, who was active in the first half of the 16th century. Gaṅgeśa and Raghunātha are two main representatives of the tradition of Navya-nyāya. Raghunātha composed a commentary on Gaṅgeśa’s *Tattvacintāmaṇi* (TC): the *Tattvacintāmaṇidīdhiti* (TCD), and further developed Gaṅgeśa’s views.

Raghunātha is known to have written three independent works: the *Padārthatattvanirūpaṇa* (“Explanation of the True Nature of the Categories”<sup>2</sup>), the *Nañvāda* (“Discourse on the Negative Particle *Nañ*”), and the *Ākhyātavāda* (“Discourse on Verbal Suffixes”). These works, more than his TCD, seem to reveal his original thinking. In order to clarify his distinctive nature, it would be helpful to compare the views expressed by Raghunātha in those works with those of his predecessors,

---

<sup>1</sup> On the founder of Navya-nyāya, see Wada [2007b: 9-23]. For background information on the authors dealt with in this paper, I have followed Potter [1995(1970)]; Potter and Bhattacharyya [1993]; Bhattacharyya and Potter [2011].

<sup>2</sup> Potter [1957] renders this title as “A Demonstration of the True Nature of the Things to Which Words Refer”.

most notably Gaṅgeśa. Since we already have outstanding research by modern scholars on the *Padārthatattvanirūpaṇa*<sup>3</sup> and the *Nañvāda*<sup>4</sup>, I decided to take up the remaining text: the *Ākhyātavāda*. In 2014 I completed a translation of one whole chapter of the “Book on Language” (Śabdakhaṇḍa)<sup>5</sup> of the *TC*, which (chapter) is given the same designation: *Ākhyātavāda*.<sup>6</sup> To understand the historical development of the Navya-nyāya view of verbal understanding (*śābdabodha*, *śābdajñāna*), it is necessary to compare Gaṅgeśa’s and Raghunātha’s statements with regard to the constituents of verbal understanding, such as the verbal suffixes of finite verbs (*ākhyāta*). Here I have focused on the discussion regarding verbal suffixes.

The main goal of the present project is to edit and translate Raghunātha’s *Ākhyātavāda*. This project is supported by funding from the Japan Society of the Promotion of Science, Tokyo, for the period of 2014 through 2016.

### Text, Commentary, Translation, and Contents

For this project, the editions of Raghunātha’s “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes” given below have been made use of, and they are listed in order of publication date. As shown in the list, the text of the “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes” is variously named according to the editions. I will discuss this issue later. My edition is based mainly upon the S2 edition.

K: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in *Tattvacintāmaṇi of Gaṅgeśa Upādhyāya*, 4 Volumes, edited with the *Āloka* of Jayadeva Miśra and the *Rahasya* of Mathurānātha, by Kāmākhyānātha Tarkavāgīśa, Vrajajivan Prachyabharati Granthamala 47,

<sup>3</sup> This text is translated with annotation by Potter [1957].

<sup>4</sup> This text is translated with annotation by Matilal [1968]. The *Nañvādakārikā* of Udayana, whose contents resemble Raghunātha’s *Nañvāda* to a great extent, is studied by Dash and Wada [2013]. The author of the *Nañvādakārikā*, Udayana, is not the great Udayana who was active in the eleventh century. The date of the former Udayana is not clearly known.

<sup>5</sup> This book is translated by Bhatta [2005]; Potter and Bhattacharyya [1993: 239-312] give a summary of the “Book on Language.” Of its chapters, the *Apūrvavāda* and the *Vidhivāda* have been translated by Jha [1986] and [1987] respectively, and the *Śabdaprāmāṇyavāda* by Mohanty [1966].

<sup>6</sup> My translation appears in Wada [2007a] [2012] [2013] [2014b], in which the title of Gaṅgeśa’s *Ākhyātavāda* is translated as the “Verbal Suffix Chapter”.

Delhi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Pratishtan, 1990, pp. 867-1009 (first published in Calcutta, 1884-1901).

- B: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in *Vādārtha-samgraha*, vol. 4, edited with the *Ākhyātavādarahasya* of Mathurānātha, the *Ākhyātavādatippaṇī* of Rāmacandra, the *Ākhyātavādatippaṇī* of Raghudeva, the *Vyākhyā* of Jayarāma, the *Vyākhyā* of Nyāyavācaspati, and the *Vyākhyā* of Rāmakṛṣṇa, by Mahādev Gangādhara Bākre, Bombay: The Gujarati Printing Press, 1931.
- T: *Ākhyātavādadīdhiti* edited by N.K. Ramanuja Tatacharya, *The Journal of the Tanjore Maharaja Serfoji's Sarasvati Mahal Library* 25(3): iii-viii, 1972.
- S: *Ākhyātavāda* included in Prabal Kumar Sen, *Ākhyātavāda of Raghunātha Śīromaṇi with Ākhyātavādavyākhyā of Rāmabhadra Sārvabhauma*, Calcutta: Sanskrit Pustak Bhandar, 1979.
- C: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in K.N. Chatterjee, *Śīromaṇi's Ākhyāta-Śakti-Vāda*, Varanasi: Kishor Vidya Niketan, 1981.
- S2 *Ākhyātavāda* included in *Ākhyātavāda and Nañvāda along with Tīppaṇī* edited by Anjit Kumar Sadhukhan, New Delhi: National Mission Centre for the Arts and Dev Publishers & Distributors, 2013.

The K edition is probably the most popular among modern scholars, and the editors of the S and C editions have made use of this edition. The T edition is a romanized text of the manuscript numbered 884/D. 6122 preserved at Tanjore Maharaja Serfoji's Sarasvati Mahal Library.

The S edition is edited by referring to the K edition and the fragment written on the margins of the manuscript of the *Ākhyātavādavyākhyā* of Rāmabhadra Sārvabhauma (ca. 1570) preserved by the editor: Sen [1979: xviii]. The *Ākhyātavādavyākhyā* is a commentary on Raghunātha's "Discourse on Verbal Suffixes", and in editing Raghunātha's text, Sen sometimes adopts readings referred to by this commentary. When the S edition was edited, both the B and T editions had not been published. Accordingly, this edition does not refer to the different readings found in both editions.

The editor of the C edition, Chatterjee [1981], does not mention the source of his edition, but the edition is quite similar to the K

edition and Chatterjee often refers to Mathurānātha's commentary with the page numbers provided along with the K edition. We can conjecture that the C edition is the same as the K edition with slight emendation.<sup>7</sup>

The S2 edition is based not only upon two manuscripts preserved in the library of Sanskrit Sahitya Parishat,<sup>8</sup> but also upon the published editions: K and S. However, it is also a fact that there exist a number of different readings between the S and S2 editions which are not mentioned in the editor's list of variants.<sup>9</sup> Fortunately, those

<sup>7</sup> The differences between the C and K editions are not major, and consist mostly of typographical errors, and they are as follows: p. 8,1: *bhāvakavyutpannatvāc* (K: p. 899,2: *-bhāvakatva-vyutpannatvāc*), p. 11,1: *(janakavyāpāram apekṣya)* (K: p. 903,3: omitted), p. 17,1: *-saṁkhyā-bhidhānābhidhānābhyām* (K: p. 911,1: *-saṁkhyābhidhānābhidhānābhyām*), p. 19,1: *kartrāder* (K: p. 918,3: *kartrāder*), p. 30,1: *astu vā* (K: p. 943,2: *astu ca*), p. 30,3: *dhārvarthatve 'i* (K: p. 944,2: *dhārvarthatve 'pi*), p. 31,1: *ākhyātepasthāpitāyā* (K: 945,2: *ākhyātopasthāpitāyā*), p. 31,2: *kriyājanmatvaṁ* (K: p. 946,1: *kriyājanyatvaṁ*), p. 32,1: *-bhāvakakarmmakṛdyoge* (K: 947,2: *-bhāvakarmmakṛdyoge*), p. 35,1: *bhuñkte* (K: p. 951,1: *bhuñkte*), p. 36,3: *sāmānādhikakaranyā-* (K: p. 959,4: *sāmānādhikakaranyā-*), p. 36,5: *dhātuvādighaṭitavāt* (K: p. 960,1: *dhātuvādighaṭitāt*), p. 38,4: *pratīpadkā-* (K: p. 964,1: *pratīpadkā-*), p. 41,2: *-śālīvamātraṁ* (K: p. 972,1: *-śālīvamātraṁ*), p. 42,1: *jānāntīyādes* (K: p. 974,1: *jānāntīyādes*), p. 45,3: *yatate ityādau* (K: p. 989,1-2: *yatata ityādau*), p. 46,3: *laḍādis tīnādyartho* (K: p. 992,1: *laḍāditīnādyartho*), p. 46,3: *ekapadottatva-* (K: p. 992,1-2: *ekapadottaratva-*), p. 51,4: *-saṁyogādimiti* (K: pp. 1006,4-1007,1: *-saṁyogādimiti*). (The differences such as 'b' and 'v' in *sub* and *suv* in the K and C editions have been ignored.)

<sup>8</sup> On the manuscripts and published editions used, see Sashukhan [2013: xxv, xxvii].

<sup>9</sup> Variants between the two editions are as follows. p. 2,1: *karottī* (S2: p. 1,5: *karottīyādi*), p. 2,2: *pacattīyuttarasya* (S2: p. 1,5: *pacattīyadyuttarasya*), p. 3,3: *vyāpārārayor aprattīteḥ* (S2: p. 1,8: *vyāpārāyora aprattīteḥ*), p. 5,2: *-janyatvājanyatya-* (S2: p. 1,14: *-janyatvājanyatva-*), p. 6,8: *yatnasyānumānāt* (S2: p. 1,24: *yatnasyānumānāta*), p. 6,10: *vartamānatvaṁ yatnasya* (S2: p. 1,25-26: *yatnasya vartamānatvaṁ*), p. 6,12: *-bhāvakatvasya vyutpannatvāc* (S2: p. 1,27: *-bhāvakatva-vyutpannatvāc*), p. 6,12: *pākajanakavyāpāreṇa* (S2: p. 1,27: omitted), p. 7,4: *śobhanah* (S2: p. 2,4: *śobhanah*), p. 8,7: *-nivāranāyādrṣṭa-* (S2: p. 2,11: *-nirākaraṇāyā drṣṭa-*), p. 8,8: *samsarga-* (S2: p. 2,12: *sambandha-*), p. 9,1: *lakāravācyē* (S2: p. 2,14: *lakāravācyedyā*), p. 9,6: *ity atra* (S2: p. 2,18: *ityādau*), p. 9,9: *ity api* (S2: p. 2,21: *ity etad api*), p. 10,1: *ekatvādīnā saṁkhyābhidhāne* (S2: p. 2,22: *ekatvādīsaṁkhyābhidhāne*), p. 10,4: *śakto* (S2: p. 2,24: *śaktau*), p. 10,4: *śaktatāvachchedakāśakyatāvachchedakāśakyatāvachchedakayoś ca* (S2: p. 2,24: *śaktatāvachchedakāśakyatāvachchedakayoh*), p. 11,1: *karmakartr-* (S2: p. 2,27: *kartrkarma-*), p. 12,2: *-naikānvayikatvasyaicitat* (S2: p. 2,31: *-naikānvayitvasyocitatvāt*), p. 12,2-3: *viśeṣyatānvyayo yogyah* (S2: p. 2,32: *viśeṣyatvenānvayayogyah*), p. 12,3-4: *tathaiva sākāṅkṣatvāt*. (S2: p. 2,33: This expression is placed at the end of the sentence.), p. 12,5: *prathamopasthāpyatayā* (S2: p. 3,1: *prathamāntapadopasthāpyatayā*), p. 12,5: *saṁkhyānvayah*. (S2: p. 3,1-2: *saṁkhyānvayah tathāivākāṅkṣitatvāt*), p. 13,3: *bhāvatiṅām api* (S2: p. 3,5-6: *bhāvatiṅām yathāyatam*), p. 13,3: *vartamānatveṣṭasādhanatvādikam* (S2: p. 3,6: *vartamānatvādiṣṭasā natvādikam*), p. 14,3: *pakṣyate maitras taṇḍula* (S2: p. 3,10: *maitrah pakṣyate taṇḍulah*), p. 14,4: *vyāpāramātropalakṣitā* (S2: p. 3,11: *vyāpāramātropalakṣikā*), p. 14,6: *aprasiddham* (S2: p. 3,12: *asiddham*), p. 15,3: *ityādau kā* (S2: p. 3,15: *ityādau saviśayavyāpārānābhidhāne kā*), p. 15,7: *gamyata* (S2: p. 3,18: *gamyate*), p. 15,8: *grāmah* (S2: p. 3,19-20: *grāmah iti*), p. 16,5: *viśeṣyaviśeṣaṇabhāvaviparyāsayā-* (S2: p. 3,24: *viśeṣaṇaviśeṣyabhāvaviparyāsayā-*), p. 16,6: *cākhyātopasthāpitabhāvanāyāḥ* (S2: p. 3,26: *cākhyātopasthāpitāyā bhāvanāyāḥ*), p. 16,8: *bhāvanāviśeṣakriyāyāḥ* (S2: p. 3,27: *bhāvanāviśayakriyāyāḥ*), p. 16,8: *tīnupasthāpitāyā bhāvanāyāḥ* (S2: p. 3,27: *tīnupasthāpitabhāvanāyāḥ*), p. 16,9: *klptānvayo* (S2: p. 3,28: *anvyayo klptah*), p. 16,11: *viklityāṁ* (S2: p. 3,30: *viklityāṁ*), p. 16,14: *prathamāntapadopasthāpyatvenaiva-* (S2: p. 3,33: *prathamāntapadopasthāpyenaiva-*), p. 18,2: *ityatra* (S2: p. 4,4: *ityādau*), p. 18,4: *maitrasya naptā caitrād anyo* (S2: p. 4,4: *caitrasya naptā maitrād anyo*), p. 19,2: *lakṣaṇā-* (S2: p. 4,11: *lakṣaṇā iti*), p. 19,3: *ākhyātasyaiva* (S2: p. 4,12: *ākhyātatvasyaiva*), p. 20,5: *iḥāpi* (S2: p. 4,17: *eveti*), p. 21,5: *kaścit* (S2: p. 4,22: *kecit*), p. 22,2: *-lābhena* (S2: p. 4,23: *-lābhāt*), p. 22,3: *paryāyatvāpatteḥ* (S2: p. 4,24: *paryāyatvāpatteḥ*), p. 22,5: *niyamataḥ* (S2: p. 4,25: omitted), p. 22,6: *yatheṣṭasādhanatvāvacakatvād* (S2: p. 4,26-27: *yathā iṣṭasādhanatvāvacakatvād*), p. 22,7: *svargādījanakatvam* (S2: p. 4,27: *svargajanakatvam*), p. 23,1: *-viśayātāvācaka-* (S2: p. 4,29: *-viśayāvācaka-*), p. 25,2: *jānāntīyādeḥ* (S2: p. 5,2: *jānāntīyādeḥ*), p. 25,8: *tu* (S2: p. 5,8: *ta*), p. 26,1: *iyāms tu viśeṣo - paratvaṁ* (S2: p. 5,10: *iyāms tu viśeṣah yat-paratvaṁ*), p. 26,2: *-āpekṣi-*

variations do not affect our interpretation of the text. Accordingly, I have decided to use the latest edition, i.e., S2, as the basis for my project. Since the S2 edition does not refer to the variants in the B and T editions, I have taken both editions into consideration in editing the text of the “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes”.

Of the commentaries on Raghunātha’s text, six commentaries were published along with the B edition by M.G. Bākṛe in 1931; those six are as follows. The author’s dates are supplied in brackets from Potter [1995(1970)] except for 2.

- (1) *Ākhyātavādarahasya* of Mathurānātha (1650)
- (2) *Ākhyātavādaṭippaṇī* of Rāmacandra (?)<sup>10</sup>
- (3) *Ākhyātavādaṭippaṇī* of Raghudeva (1660)
- (4) *Vyākhyā* of Jayarāma (1620)
- (5) *Vyākhyā* of Nyāyavācaspati (1630)
- (6) *Vyākhyā* of Rāmakṛṣṇa (1570)

Sen [1979: xv] edits one of the oldest commentaries on Raghunātha’s text, the *Ākhyātavādavyākhyā* of Rāmabhadra (ca. 1570), and reports that *Vaṅge Navya-Nyāya Carcā* written by Dineshchandra Bhattacharya in Bengali gives the names of ten commentators as follows. The author’s dates are supplied in brackets from Potter [1995(1970)] except for 7 and 10.

- (1) Rāmakṛṣṇa Bhattācārya Cakravartī (1570)
- (2) Kṛṣṇadāsa Sārvabhauma (1570)
- (3) Bhavānanda Siddhāntavāgīśa (1600)
- (4) Mathurānātha Tarkavāgīśa (1650)
- (5) Jayarāma Nyāyapāncānana (1620)
- (6) Viśvanātha Siddhāntapañcānana (1635)
- (7) Rāmacandra Nyāyavāgīśa (?)<sup>11</sup>

*phaṃ* (S2: p. 5,11: - *āpekṣikam*), p. 27,2: *svaviśayakapadārthā-* (S2: p. 5,12: *svaviśayapadārthā-*), p. 27,3: *āśrayatvam* (S2: p. 5,13: *svāśrayatvam*), p. 31,2: *vyāpāravigame* (S2: p. 5,24: *vyāpāravigame phalasattve*), p. 31,8-9: *karmakartṛpratyayavyavahārah.* (S2: p. 5,30-31: *kartṛkarma-pratyayavyavahārah.*), p. 32,2: *-nirūpītatvam* (S2: p. 5,33: *-nirūpītam*), p. 32,2: *karmakṛta āśrayah.* (S2: p. 5,33: *karmakṛtaphalasya āśrayah.*), p. 32,10: *-vyacchedasyāpratyaya-* (S2: p. 6,8: *-vyacchedasyāpratīti-*), p. 33,5: *saṃyogamātra-* (S2: p. 6,13: *saṃyogatvamātra-*), p. 33,5: *na tatra* (S2: p. 6,13: *na tu tatra*), p. 33,6: *pratyayavācītetī* (S2: p. 6,13: *pratyayasya vyāpāravācītetī*), p. 34,1: *prayogasādhitva-* (S2: p. 6,14: *prayogasādhitā-*), p. 34,4: *tyajatyādeh* (S2: p. 6,17: *tyajatyādeh*), p. 35,1: *-tattadvyāpāra-* (S2: p. 6,18: *-tattadvyāpāra-*), p. 35,4: *prasaṅgād anādeyam* (S2: p. 6,20-21: *prasaṅgād anupādeyam*),

<sup>10</sup> Sadhukhan [2013: xxiv] dates Rāmacandra between 1600-1675.

<sup>11</sup> On the date of Rāmacandra, see fn. 10.

- (8) Rudra Nyāyavācaspati (1630)
- (9) Raghudeva Nyāyalaṅkāra (1660)
- (10) Rūpanārāyaṇa<sup>12</sup> (?)

Sadhukhan [2013: xxiii-xxiv] mentions thirteen commentaries with their author's dates and some information on the texts or their manuscripts. When the author's date differs from Potter's, the latter is given after a colon in brackets.

- (1) *Ākhyātadīdhitiṣārīṇī* of Kṛṣṇadāsa Sārvabhauma (c. 1500-1550: 1570)
- (2) *Ākhyātavādavyākhyā* of Rāmabhadra Sārvabhauma (first half of the 16th century: 1570): Sadhukhan says that this commentary is available with the S edition.
- (3) *Ākhyātavādaṭṭippanī* of Bhavānanda Siddhāntavāgīśa (fl. 1550-1575: 1600). This commentary is available with the S2 edition.
- (4) *Ākhyātavādarahasya* of Mathrānātha Tarkavāgīśa (1500-1590: 1650). This commentary is available with the K edition.
- (5) *Ākhyātavādasadvyākhyā* of Rāmakṛṣṇa Bhammācārya Cakravartin (first half of the 16th century: 1570)
- (6) *Ākhyātavādaṭṭippanī* of Rāmacandra Nyāyavāgīśa (1600-1676)
- (7) Commentary on the *Ākhyātavāda* by Rūpanārāyaṇa (no date)
- (8) *Ākhyātavādavyākhyāna* of Rudra Nyāyavācaspati (fl. 1590: 1630)
- (9) *Ākhyātavādamīkā* of Viśvanātha Siddhāntapañcānana (c. 1550: 1635)
- (10) *Ākhyātavādaṭṭīkā* of Raghudeva Nyāyalaṅkāra (fl. c. 1657: 1660)
- (11) *Ākhyātavādavyākhyā* of Jayarāma Nyāyapañcānana (fl. c. 1657: 1620)
- (12) *Ākhyātavādadīpikā* of Tolāppārya (no date)
- (13) *Granthivimukti* of Rāghavabhaṭṭa (no date: date unknown)

---

<sup>12</sup> Sen numbers this commentator as 13 and not as 10. I am not sure whether Sen made a mistake in numbering or whether the three commentators numbered as 10, 11, and 12 were missing.

Among the commentaries on the “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes” mentioned in the above two lists, I have used mainly that of Mathurānātha (ca. 1650), following Sen [1979: xvi], the editor of the S edition. Sen notes that Mathurānātha’s commentary is more extensive and outshines the commentary of his teacher, Rāmabhadra (ca. 1570). However, one can also say that Rāmabhadra’s commentary is very straightforward and helpful, so I have made use of this commentary also. It should be mentioned that this commentary is one of the oldest among the commentaries.

On the translations and summaries of the “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes” we have one translation and three summaries. Chatterjee [1981] translates this text with a summary. His translation is old and does not necessarily show the structure of the text. We primarily need a new translation written with a new terminology accepted by modern scholars. Another summary, by Sen [1993], roughly reveals the structure of the text and has greatly helped me in its translation. Sadhukhan [2013: xvi-xxii] also gives a general summary of the text, which helps us in understanding the text.

On the structure of the “Discourse on Verbal Suffixes”, Sen [1993] shows nine divisions in his summary. I have basically followed Sen but have divided the Sanskrit text into eleven Parts;<sup>13</sup> Sen’s third division I have divided into Parts C and D, his fifth, sixth, seventh and eighth divisions are combined into Parts F, G, and H, and his eighth division is divided into Parts I and J.<sup>14</sup> The difference between Sen’s divisions and my parts is not that all significant. It occurs only for the sake of convenience; for example, Sen’s third division contains the Mimāṃsā view and the Nyāya refutation of it, while I have assigned the former to Part C and the latter to Part D.

Though I have used the S2 edition as the basis for editing the text, I have also provided the page and line numbers of the K edition due to its popularity among modern scholars. In addition, I have supplied the page and line numbers of Sen’s edition (S), since his summary refers to those numbers and is readily available.

<sup>13</sup> As the translation with annotation proceeds, the title of each Part may be slightly changed.

<sup>14</sup> Exact correspondences between Sen’s divisions and my parts are as follows. The page numbers refer to those of his edition (S). S division (abbreviated as ‘d’ in this footnote): S.d1 (pp. 1-2) to Part A; S.d2 (p. 3) to Part B; S.d3 (pp. 5-8) to Parts C and D; S.d4 (pp. 9-11) to Part E; S.d5-7 (pp. 12-29) to Parts F, G, and H; S.d8 (pp. 30-34) to Parts I and J; S.d9 (p. 35) to Part K.

- A. The General View of Old Nyāya (S2, p. 1,3-6; K, pp. 867-876,1; S, pp. 1-2)
- B. The General View of New Nyāya (S2, p. 1,7-12; K, pp. 876,1-888,1; S, p. 3)
- C. The Mīmāṃsā Refutation of Old Nyāya (S2, pp. 1,13-2,5; K, pp. 888,1-903,3; S, pp. 5-7)
- D. The Old and New Nyāya Refutation of the Mīmāṃsā View (S2, p. 2,6-13; K, pp. 903,3-909,1; S, p. 8)
- E. The Vaiyākaraṇa View (S2, p. 2,14-30; K, pp. 909,1-924,1; S, pp. 9-11)
- F. The New Nyāya Refutation of the Vaiyākaraṇa View (S2, pp. 2,31-3,12; K, pp. 924,1-939,2; S, pp. 12-14)
- G. The Old Nyāya View on the Verbal Understanding of a Passive Sentence (S2, p. 3,13-20; K, pp. 939,2-942,4; S, p. 15)
- H. The New Nyāya View on the Verbal Understanding of a Passive Sentence and the *kṛt* Suffix for the Agent or Object (S2, p. 3,21-5,19; K, pp. 942,5-990; S, pp. 16-29)
- I. The View of the Followers of Maṇḍana Mīśra (S2, pp. 5,20-6,15; K, pp. 991-1006,2; S, pp. 30-34,1)
- J. The New Nyāya Refutation of Maṇḍana's followers (S2, p. 6,15-17; K, pp. 1006,2-1007; S, p. 34,2-4)
- K. The View of the Prabhākara School and Its Refutation (S2, p. 6,18-21; K, pp. 1008-1009; S, 35)

### The Titles of the Sanskrit Texts

The Sanskrit title of Raghunātha's "Discourse on Verbal Suffixes" varies according to the editions referred to above. The books including the K and B editions show in their headers the title 'Ākhyātaśaktivāda', while those editions end with the colophon referring to the text as Ākhyātavāda. The T edition has 'Ākhyātavādādīdhiti' for its title but has 'Ākhyātavāda' in its colophon. Generally speaking, the term 'dīdhiti' is often employed at the end of the title of Raghunātha's commentaries. The S edition gives only the title 'Ākhyātavāda', and its editor, Sen [1979], uses this title throughout his book. Chatterjee [1981] uses the title 'Ākhyātaśaktivāda' for the C edition, while he inserts 'Ākhyātavāda' in the header of the book. Sadhukhan [2013] designates the S2 edition as Ākhyātavāda. In the volumes of the

*Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies*, most of which have been edited by Karl H. Potter, we find two titles: Ākhyāta(śakti)vāda in Potter [1995(1970): 545] and Ākhyātavāda in Bhattacharyya and Potter [2011: 535]. Therefore, we can conjecture that in order to differentiate Raghunātha's text from Gaṅgeśa's Ākhyātavāda, the tradition designates Raghunātha's text as the Ākhyātavādadīdhiti or Ākhyātaśaktivāda. In the present paper, following Sen [1979], I will refer to Raghunātha's text as the *Ākhyātavāda*, whose English rendering is the "Discourse on Verbal Suffixes".

Mathurānātha's commentary on Raghunātha's text, which has been the most helpful in the present project, is also given various names according to the editors. The commentary edited with the K edition is given the title of Ākhyātaśaktivādavivṛti at its beginning and of Ākhyātavādarahasya at its end. The title given by Bākre, the editor of the B edition, is Ākhyātavādarahasya, probably because he follows the description in the colophon of the text. Bhattacharyya and Potter [2011: 432] introduce the commentary with the heading 'Vivṛti or Rahasya on Raghunātha Śīromaṇi's *Ākhātavāda*'. It appears significant that they give the title of Vivṛti first and then Rahasya, because immediately after their heading they adopt the reverse order to refer to Mathurānātha's commentary on Udayana's work: '*Rahasya or Vivṛti on Udayana's Āmatattvaviveka or Bauddhadhikkāra*'. Mathurānātha wrote many commentaries on different texts, and most of them include the term Rahasya in their titles.<sup>15</sup> In the case of his commentary on the "Discourse on Verbal Suffixes" also we can conjecture that in order to differentiate Mathurānātha's commentary from his commentaries on other texts, the tradition refers to this commentary of Mathurānātha's with the title including the term Rahasya. I would like to make use of the designation of Vivṛti for this commentary.

In a forthcoming article I will explain basic concepts such as the verbal root (*dhātu*), the verbal suffix of a finite verb (*ākhyāta*), effort (*yatna*, *prayatna*), the signifying function (*vṛtti*), verbal understanding (*śābdabodha*, *śābdajñāna*), meaning (*artha*), which are used or presupposed in the discussion held in Raghunātha's "Discourse on Verbal Suffixes". That article will then be included in the annotated translation of the text: Parts A through D.

(to be continued)

<sup>15</sup> For the titles of Mathurānātha's commentaries, see Bhattacharyya and Potter [2011: 17-18].

BIBLIOGRAPHY AND ABBREVIATIONS

PRIMARY SOURCES:

- Ākhyātavāda* or *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* or *Ākhyātavādādīdhiti* of Raghunātha Śiromaṇi.  
 B: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in *Vādārtha-saṃgraha*, vol. 4, edited by Mahādev Gangādhara Bākre, Bombay: The Gjarati Printing Press, 1931.  
 C: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in Chatterjee [1981].  
 K: *Ākhyātaśaktivāda* included in *Tattvacintāmaṇi of Gaṅgeśa Upādhyāya*, 4 Volumes, edited by Kāmākhyānātha Tarkavāgīśa, Vrajajivan Prachyabharati Granthamala 47, Delhi: Chaukhamba Sanskrit Pratishthan, 1990, pp. 867-1009. (First published: Calcutta: Asiatic Society, 1884-1901)  
 S: *Ākhyātavāda* included in Sen [1979].  
 S2: *Ākhyātavāda* included in Sadhukhan [2013].  
 T: *Ākhyātavādādīdhiti* edited by N. K. Ramanuja Tatacharya, *The Journal of the Tanjore Maharaja Serfoji's Sarasvati Mahal Library* 25(3): iii-viii, 1972.  
*Ākhyātaśaktivādavivrti* or *Ākhyātavādarahasya* of Mathurānātha Tarkavāgīśa, included in *Tattvacintāmaṇi of Gaṅgeśa Upādhyāya*, 4 Volumes. See *Ākhyātavāda*: K.  
 TC: *Tattvacintāmaṇi of Gaṅgeśa Upādhyāya*, 4 Volumes. See *Ākhyātavāda*: K.  
 TCD: *Tattvacintāmaṇidīdhiti* of Raghunātha Śiromaṇi, included in *Gādādhari*, 2 vols., edited by Vāmācaraṇa Bhaṭṭācārya and others, Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series 42, Benaras: Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series Office, 1970.

SECONDARY SOURCES:

- Bhatta, V.P.  
 2005 *Word: The Śabdakhaṇḍa of the Tattvacintāmaṇi*, 2 vols., Delhi: Eastern Book Linkers.  
 Bhattacharyya, Sibajiban and Karl H. Potter (ed.)  
 2011 *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, vol. 13: Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika Philosophy from 1515 to 1660*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.  
 Chatterjee, K.N.  
 1981 *Śiromaṇi's Ākhyāta-Śakti-Vāda*, Varanasi: Kishor Vidya Niketan.  
 Dash, Subash and Toshihiro Wada  
 2013 *A Navya-nyāya Discussion on the Meaning of the Negative Particle Nañ: A Study of the Nañvādakārikā of Udayana*, Studia Asiatica 10, Nagoya: Nagoya University Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies.  
 Jha, V.N.  
 1986 *The Logic of the Intermediate Causal Link*, Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications.  
 1987 *The Philosophy of Injunction*, Delhi: Pratibha Prakashan.  
 Matilal, Bimal Krishna  
 1968 *The Navya-Nyāya Doctrine of Negation*, Harvard Oriental Series 40, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.  
 Mohanty, Jitendranath  
 1966 *Gaṅgeśa's Theory of Truth*, Santiniketan: Centre of Advanced Study in Philosophy Viśva-bharati.  
 Potter, Karl H.  
 1957 *The Padārthattvanirūpaṇam of Raghunātha Śiromaṇi*, Harvard- Yenching Institute Studies 17, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.  
 1977 *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, vol. 2: Indian Metaphysics and Epistemology: The tradition of Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika up to Gaṅgeśa*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.  
 1995(1970) *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, vol. 1: Bibliography*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.  
 Potter, Karl H. and Sibajiban Bhattacharyya (ed.)  
 1993 *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, vol. 6: Indian Philosophical Analysis: Nyāya-Vaiśeṣika from Gaṅgeśa to Raghunātha Śiromaṇi*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.  
 Sadhukhan, Sanjit Kumar  
 2013 *Ākhyātavāda and Nañvāda along with Tīppant*, New Delhi: National Mission for Manuscripts / Dev Publishers & Distributors.  
 Sen, Prabal Kumar  
 1979 *Ākhyātavāda of Raghunātha Śiromaṇi with Ākhyātavādavyākhyā of Rāmabhadra Sārvabhauma*, Calcutta: Sanskrit Pustak Bhandar.  
 1993 "Ākhyātavāda", in Potter and Bhattacharyya [1993: 535-541, 626].  
 Wada, Toshihiro  
 1990 *Invariable Concomitance in Navya-Nyāya*, Sri Garib Dass Oriental Series 101, Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications.

- 1999 “Shin Niyāya Gakuha no Kigen to Bunseki Hōhō” (The Origin of Navya-Nyāya and the Position of This School in the History of Indian Logic), *Indo-Shisōshi Kenkyū* (Studies in the History of Indian Thought) 11: 15-41. (in Japanese)
- 2000 “Liberation in Early Navya-nyāya”, in S. Mayeda, Y. Matsunami, M. Tokunaga, H. Marui (eds.), *The Way to Liberation: Indological Studies in Japan*, Japanese Studies on South Asia 3, Delhi: Manohar, pp. 107-121.
- 2001 “The Analytical Method of Navya-Nyāya”, *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 29: 519-530.
- 2004 “The Origin of Navya-nyāya and Its Place within the History of Indian Logic”, in S. Hino and T. Wada (eds.), *Three Mountains and Seven Rivers: Professor Musashi Tachikawa's Felicitatation Volume*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, pp. 439-462.
- 2007a “Gaṅgeśa on the Meaning of Verbal Suffixes (1)”, in K. Preisendanz (ed.), *Expanding and Merging Horizons: Contributions to South Asian and Cross-Cultural Studies in Commemoration of Wilhelm Halbfass*, Vienna: the Austrian Academy of Sciences, pp. 415-429.
- 2007b *The Analytical Method of Navya-nyāya*, Gonda Indological Studies 14, Groningen: Egbert Forsten Publishing. (This includes Wada [2001] [2004].)
- 2012 “Gaṅgeśa on the Meaning of Verbal Suffixes (2)”, in C. Watanabe, M. Desmarais, and Y. Honda (eds.), *Saṃskṛta-Sādhutā: Goodness of Sanskrit: Studies in Honour of Professor Ashok N. Aklujkar*, New Delhi: D.K. Printworld, pp. 528-544.
- 2013 “Gaṅgeśa on the Meaning of Verbal Suffixes (3)”, *Nagoya Studies in Indian Culture and Buddhism: Sambhāṣā* 30: 1-14.
- 2014a “Gaṅgeśa's Theory on the Meaning of Verbal Suffixes”, in K. Bhattacharya (ed.), *Papers from the 15th World Sanskrit Conference: Nagoya Studies in Indian Culture and Buddhism: Sambhāṣā* 31: 61-75.
- 2014b “Gaṅgeśa on the Meaning of Verbal Suffixes”, *Sanskrit Studies* 3: 178-209.

\* I wish to thank Dr. Charles Pain for correcting my English. The present research is carried out under the auspices of a 2014-2016 Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (C) by the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science, Tokyo.

*Professor*  
*Dept. of Indian Studies*  
*Nagoya University*